

Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](https://www.sciencedirect.com)

Carbohydrate Polymer Technologies and Applications

journal homepage: www.sciencedirect.com/journal/carbohydrate-polymer-technologies-and-applications



Learning from hype *en route* to fulfill the industrial potential of nanocellulose

Rosaria Ciriminna^{a,*}, Giuseppe Angellotti^a, Rafael Luque^{b,*}, Matteo Formenti^c, Cristina Della Pina^{c,*}, Mario Pagliaro^{a,*}

^a Istituto per lo Studio dei Materiali Nanostrutturati, CNR, via U. La Malfa 153, 90146, Palermo, Italy

^b Universidad ECOTEC, Km 13.5 Samborodón, Samborodón, ECO92302, Ecuador

^c Dipartimento di Chimica, Università degli Studi di Milano, via Golgi 19, 20133, Milano, Italy

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Nanocellulose
Cellulose nanofiber
Green chemistry
Bioeconomy
Nanotechnology hype

ABSTRACT

Endowed with exceptional chemical and physical properties that make it potentially useful in a wide array of industrial sectors, nanocellulose remains a niche industrial product chiefly manufactured in the form of microfibrillated cellulose for low value utilization in paper and cardboard products. This study first shows that the case of nanocellulose adds to many other cases of overpromising typical of the nanosciences. Hence, it suggests that fulfilling the industrial potential of nanocellulose may benefit from the main lessons learned during the hype technology cycle (attention trigger, peak of inflated expectations, disappointment). Renewed management and research efforts aimed at large-scale production of this bionanomaterial will rather focus on the interdisciplinary approach to green chemistry required to make economically viable the green extraction routes with which to replace current energy-intensive and wasteful fibrillation processes.

1. Introduction

With a production (and decomposition) rate of ~1500 billion tons per year, cellulose is the most abundant biopolymer in nature (Klemm, Heublein, Fink & Bohn, 2005). For comparison, the global production of steel in 2022 amounted to ~1.9 billion tons and that of plastics to ~0.4 billion tons. Nanocellulose, namely cellulose fibrils with widths in the nanometer range (Klemm et al., 2011), is a bionanomaterial endowed with truly exceptional chemical and physical properties that make it potentially useful in a wide array of industrial sectors, including those where steel and oil-derived plastics are widely employed (Dufresne, 2019). Potential applications include advanced sectors well beyond paper making and cardboard packaging, to include enhanced membranes for fuel cells and water purification, aerogels, implant biomaterials, nanocomposites for car, boat and aircraft making, flexible electronics, stronger and more versatile coatings, and enhanced batteries (Klemm et al., 2018).

Research in the field is booming. In 2006 the research database Scopus indexed three studies dealing with nanocellulose (one book chapter, one conference paper, and one review) in the international

scientific literature (Scopus, 2024a).

By the end of 2023, the same research database indexed 10,721 studies dealing with nanocellulose, of which 8,144 were journal original research articles, 1002 review articles, and 765 conference papers (Scopus, 2024a). Pointing to the global dimension of research in the field, said studies were authored by scholars based in 119 different countries (the fifth of which, with 651 studies, is Malaysia) (Scopus, 2024a).

Regardless of the aforementioned substantial research efforts, however, the market for nanocellulose remains small, with certain market analysts estimating it at \$350 million in 2022 (Market Research Future, 2023) and others at just \$34 million (Market Data Forecast, 2023). Different market analysts, however, agree in predicting rapid market growth (compound annual growth rate of 20%), with the overall market estimated to reach \$628 million by 2028 (Market Research Future, 2023) and \$1.1 billion by 2030 (Market Data Forecast, 2023).

Yet, similar estimates published in the early 2010s largely failed to predict the forthcoming industrial output. For example, in 2022 just 80 tons of cellulose nanofiber (CNF) were produced globally (Yano Research Institute, 2023).

* Corresponding authors.

E-mail addresses: rosaria.ciriminna@cnr.it (R. Ciriminna), rluque@ecotec.edu.ec (R. Luque), cristina.dellapina@unimi.it (C. Della Pina), mario.pagliaro@cnr.it (M. Pagliaro).

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carpta.2024.100512>

Available online 15 May 2024

2666-8939/© 2024 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

Analyzing the main technological and economic barriers to nanocellulose commercial uptake, Clauser and co-workers recently concluded that it is necessary “to develop new methods to produce new nanocellulose-based materials including environmentally friendly processes of extraction at a lower cost with reduced energy consumption processes” (Clauser, Felissia, Area & Vallejos, 2022). Put briefly, cellulose nanocrystals (CNCs) are extracted from cellulose by acid hydrolysis, microfibrillated cellulose (MFC) by mechanical treatment, and bacterial cellulose (BC) is microbially produced. Other critical challenges identified include the need to access low-cost raw material and to improve so far deficient coordination among government, industry, and academia (Clauser, Felissia, Area & Vallejos, 2022).

As emphasized by the same team, confusion in the marketplace also originates from a surprising confusion in nomenclature (Clauser, Felissia, Area & Vallejos, 2022). For example, MFC is often confused with CNF made partly oxidizing the cellulose primary alcohols via the 2,2,6,6-tetramethyl-1-piperidinyloxy (TEMPO)-mediated de Nooy's process to selectively oxidise polysaccharides using bleach at alkaline pH (de Nooy, Besemer & van Bekkum, 1995), followed by mechanical fibrillation (Saito et al., 2006).

Using “cellulose nanofiber” as search query in the title of documents indexed by the Scopus research database, in 2022 Lam and co-workers concluded that “studies on CNF began in 2004” (Lam, Lee & Lam, 2022). The article in question, on the other hand, is a NMR-based investigation of the rheological properties of a hydrogel, comprised of an aqueous dispersion of 10 nm cellulose nanofibers obtained via acid hydrolysis of cellulose with concentrated sulfuric acid (Ono, Shimaya, Sato & Ongu, 2004). In today's terminology, we are dealing therefore with CNC. Ranby and Ribí discovered CNC in Sweden in 1949 by using boiling aqueous H₂SO₄ 2.5 N to extract the nanocrystals consisting of highly crystalline cellulose I rod-shaped particles 50–400 nm x 5–10 nm that do not swell in water (Ranby & Ribí, 1950). Nearly thirty years later, in 1977, Turbak and co-workers discovered MFC and published the discovery in 1983 (Turbak, Snyder & Sandberg, 1983).

In a key analysis on nanocellulose-related patents granted between years 1920 and 2011, Vázquez, Charreau and co-workers found that compared to MFC and BC, CNC gave place to the lowest number of patents, with their owners mainly being universities and public institutions (Charreau, Foresti & Vázquez, 2013). However, growth in the number of patents was substantial for each nanocellulose form, with the years 2010 and 2011 having been the most prolific for each category. According to the same analysis, companies involved in nanocellulose field mostly originate from the pulp and paper industry.

In 2020, the team extended the analysis to nanocellulose patents granted between 2010 and 2017 finding an “astonishing increase” since 2010 (Charreau, Cavallo & Foresti, 2020). In detail, the scholars identified 4500 new patents, nearly 70 % of which published in the last three years surveyed (2015–2017). Clearly, nanocellulose had become a hot topic of industrial research. Again, most patenting companies were interested in CNF (~1700 patents) and BC (~1800 patents) rather than in CNC (~950 patents). Compared to the previous analysis of patents granted up to 2011 (Charreau, Foresti & Vázquez, 2013), in years between 2010 and 2017 along with Japan, China and the United States of America emerged as the most active countries in industrial research (Charreau, Cavallo & Foresti, 2020).

Overpromising has been a constant trait of the nanosciences (Mody, 2006). The case of nanocellulose, we show in this study, makes no exception. The study concludes suggesting that fulfillment of nanocellulose industrial potential may benefit from lessons learned during the hype technology cycle (attention trigger, peak of inflated expectations, disappointment) induced by over-optimistic promises of the technology proponents (Bareis, Roßmann & Bordignon, 2023). Assisting renewed management efforts aimed at large-scale production of this bionanomaterial based on economically viable green extraction routes (Ciriminna, Ghahremani, Karimi & Pagliaro, 2023), said lessons may also be useful to researchers as “the excitement” (Abitbol et al., 2016)

that in 2016 surrounded “nanocellulose research” (Abitbol et al., 2016) has long been replaced by skepticism due to misleading and unmet expectations as it happened for many nanotechnologies (Klaessig, 2021).

2. Methodology

A search of overpromises and bold claims concerning nanocellulose was performed on the world wide web using different search engines. The web pages identified by the search engines included nanotechnology dissemination magazines, trade and scientific journals. The use of web sources such as news articles, webzines, or trade journals, namely of not peer reviewed literature, should not raise concerns about the validity of the findings because (see below) the cited news articles generally refer to peer reviewed studies with statements from their authors.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Nanocellulose technology hype

Writing about nanocellulose identified as “a cheap, conductive, stronger-than-Kevlar wonder material made from wood pulp”, Anthony in 2012 wrote on a widely read technology webzine:

“In July, the US Forest Service opened the country's first nanocellulose plant in Madison, Wisconsin. This is only the third nanocellulose plant in the world, with the other two being in Canada and Sweden. The CelluForce factory in Montreal is now producing a tonne of nanocellulose per day. After a ramping-up period of a couple of years, the US Forest Service expects to sell nanocellulose for just a few dollars per kilo” (Anthony, 2012).

The aforementioned plant in Montreal producing CNC with a capacity of 300 t/a was built in 2012 in Windsor, Quebec, on the site of a pulp and paper mill jointly owning the new company (Berry, 2019). Ten years later, the company reported annual revenue of \$4,705,000 (Equity, 2024). Nanocellulose, however, has never been “cheap”. For example, even if a thorough cost manufacturing estimate in a peer reviewed study going back to 2017 pointed to a manufacturing cost for CNC production “ranging from \$3632 to \$4420/t” (Abbati de Assis et al., 2017), the price of CNC commercialized by the end of 2023 by a nanomaterial manufacturer based in Turkey varied between €5.4/g and €1.147/g, depending on the amount purchased (5 g or 1000 g, respectively) (Nanomaterial Powder, 2023).

In a seminar aptly entitled “Cellulose nanofibrils (CNF) - a big hype or on the edge of a breakthrough” researchers based in Finland in 2015 concluded that CNF was “on the verge of a breakthrough” (Qvintus & Kangas, 2015) and that “availability will soon” no longer limit applications even if some applications were “far, far away” (Qvintus & Kangas, 2015). Identifying cost competitiveness as the main challenge to nanocellulose practical applications, the same researchers highlighted the relevance of enzymatic fibrillation as a low energy input, low cost route to nanocellulose. Using an enzyme cocktail comprised of cellulase enzymes with both endo- and exo-glucanase activity and minor hemicellulase activities, the HefCel (High-consistency Enzymatic Fibrillation of Cellulose) process was indeed developed at their Labs at the VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland (Jaiswal et al., 2021) Research continued, and researchers at the same Finland's institution developed a compostable transparent film based on said nanocellulose combined with hydrophobic cellulose fatty acid ester “which looks and performs like plastic in food packaging” (Vähä-Nissi, 2018). In mid 2022, the production of packaging material was in the pilot phase and its extensive industrial use was forecasted to take place “in 5-7 years” (VTT, 2022).

Looking for nanocellulose-related information in nanotechnology webzines, on December 2023 we conducted a search using the “nanocellulose” query at *Nanowerk*, a website dedicated to nanotechnology online since 2005 at the URL: nanowerk.com. The search returned 479

results (Nanowerk, 2023). In one of them, a “spotlight” news article published on May 2023, a renowned author of nanotechnology books published by the Royal Society of Chemistry (Berger, 2024) wrote:

“The development of nanocellulose-based flexible materials is still in its nascent stages. There are significant challenges that need to be addressed before these materials can be widely adopted. Notably, nanocellulose is currently relatively expensive to produce,... current production methods are not equipped to meet the demands of large-scale production... additionally... nanocellulose is a highly sensitive material that can degrade easily... posing a substantial challenge to the development of durable, long-lasting nanocellulose-based materials” (Berger, 2023).

In another news article at *nanowerk* going back to 2020 an officer of Aalto University reported the news for which “Material manufacturing from particles takes a giant step forward”:

“The ability of nanocelluloses to bring together particles into cohesive materials is at the root of the study that links decades of research into nanoscience towards manufacturing... nanofibers extracted from plants are used as universal binders for particles to form a variety of functional or structural materials ... As pointed out by the main author, Dr Bruno Mattos, “This means that nanocelluloses induce high cohesion in particulate materials in a constant and controlled manner for all particles types. Because of such strong binding properties, such materials can now be built with predictable properties and therefore easily engineered’...” (Aalto University, 2020).

Entitled “Nanotechnology in the pulp and paper industry”, another “spotlight” news article going back to 2013 written by an officer of the Paper and Fibre Research Institute (PFI) informed readers that:

“One of the first scientific articles, which reported the advantages of a nanopaper concept for barrier applications, was published by PFI and NTNU researchers. Due to the intrinsic strength of cellulose nanofibrils and their ability to self-assemble, dense and strong nanobarriers and nanocomposites can be manufactured...A necessary step to realize the above-mentioned applications requires the development of effective industrial production of nanocellulose, with affordable production costs. PFI and industrial project partners demonstrated that nanocellulose can be produced industrially, in large scale (1.5 tonne/day) and with low energy consumption (1600 kWh/tonne). This is considered a significant achievement and implies that nanocellulose from wood can be produced in large quantities, which is a major advantage compared to e.g. bacterial cellulose (Chinga Carrasco, 2020).”

Recognizing “the potential and the hype” and noting that “forest companies” (i.e., wood and paper mill companies) may have the right resources to produce nanocellulose in large amount, in 2014 Eklund published a Master thesis in business administration at Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences aimed at answering two research questions: “why has the commercialization of nanocellulose not yet succeeded?” and “does nanocellulose hold a high market potential?” (Eklund, 2014).

Enquiring directly with Sweden-based wood and paper industries, Eklund found that nanocellulose production never started because nanocellulose was considered an additive to be used in existing or new products with little or no market demand (“demand is uncertain”). Wood and paper mill companies were found willing to support the forest bioeconomy. “Nevertheless”, Eklund succinctly concluded “it has come to a point where everyone is willing to participate at the party but no one is willing to buy the ingredients needed for baking the cake - mainly because the guests’ preferences are uncertain” (Eklund, 2014).

We briefly remind that the advent of the internet has led to a dramatic decline of paper (newsprint and printing and writing papers) demand (Latta, Plantinga & Sloggy, 2016), apparently originating the

need for a wealthy (and old) industry such as the paper industry to develop new cellulose-based products.

In the subsequent decade, production of the bionanomaterial barely grew, but the hype surrounding nanocellulose continued unabated. For instance, in 2012 the scientific magazine *New Scientist* called nanocellulose “Nature’s wonder stuff taking the world by storm” (Ferguson, 2012).

Even limiting the analysis to the peer reviewed literature, in 2013, Dufresne called it “a new ageless bionanomaterial” (Dufresne, 2013); Thomas and co-workers in 2018 termed nanocellulose as “one of the most promising green materials of modern times” (Thomas et al., 2018); Norrahim et al. called it in 2021 “the next super versatile material for the military” (Norrahim et al., 2021); while in 2023 Lin and co-workers called nanocellulose “an amazing nanomaterial with diverse applications in food science” (Zhang, Shen, Yang & Lin, 2023), and Bharimalla et al. “a novel and revolutionary nanostructured... material with tremendous functionality” (Bharimalla et al., 2023).

Table 1 summarizes selected hyping items for nanocellulose from selected peer reviewed recent studies.

3.2. Lessons learned

Bareis and co-workers have lately shown how, acting as attention-seekers riding “on the wave of attention” hypes in science and technology are “less interested in the long-term societal consequences of what happens when the wave collapses” (Bareis, Roßmann & Bordignon, 2023). Amid the long-term societal consequences of technology hype is investor disillusionment that, in its turn, will result in delayed (or permanent lack of) uptake of innovation.

It is therefore instructive to learn from successful innovators in the field of nanocellulose, namely from nanocellulose science and technology practitioners who succeeded in developing nanocellulose-based products demanded by the market. Though selling at \$50 g⁻¹ (Dastager, 2021), being made via inefficient fermentation methods using an expensive growth medium (Alriksson, 2018), bacterial nanocellulose for enhanced wound dressings so far is the most successful practical application of nanocellulose. *XCell*, *Gengiflex*, *Membracel*, *Nanoskin*, *Securin*, and *Epiprotect* are the tradenames of just a few BC-based wound dressings currently available on the market (Hou et al., 2023).

Serafica, a biochemical engineer, after his undergraduate studies in the Philippines moved to the USA where he got his doctorate in biochemical engineering and subsequently established his own company in the field of BC in 1996. Discussing the company’s activities in various areas that contributed to the commercialization of the first two series of company’s products (Serafica, 2016), in 2016 he emphasized the unique nature of bacterial nanocellulose as a platform technology. The fermentation process indeed yields a very thin and pliable form, which is remarkably strong and yet gas and liquid permeable due to microporosity. Serafica underlined also the need for scientists to meet industry and innovate in order to solve real problems (“let the users decide the product for you, and become intimately associated with them because they will be the one to adopt it” (Serafica, 2016)).

Table 1

Hype term or sentence for nanocellulose from selected examples in recent peer reviewed literature.

Term/Sentence	Reference, Year
“One of the most promising green materials of modern times”	(Thomas et al., 2018)
“The next super versatile material for the military”	(Norrahim et al., 2021)
“A novel and revolutionary nanostructured material with tremendous functionality”	(Bharimalla et al., 2023)
“A new ageless bionanomaterial”	(Dufresne, 2013)
“An amazing nanomaterial with diverse applications in food science”	(Zhang, R.Shen, Yang & Lin, 2023)

BC, for instance, was used by his company to treat venous leg ulcers with the added activity of accelerating the granulation and autolytic debridement of necrotic tissue with the fine, nonwoven, cellulose hydrophilic fibers comprising the multi-layered three-dimensional structure of bacterially synthesized *XCell* nanocellulose (Frankel, Serafica & Damien, 2004); but also in neurosurgery as the first brain implantable product (brain patch) during a nine-year (2003-2012) development period that included prototype development, safety testing, and animal effectiveness testing costing about \$20 million (Serafica, 2016).

Having high strength and excellent biocompatibility the material is also able to either donate or absorb moisture (in the 4-5 % ideal cellulose content corresponding to the intersection of the two “donation” and “absorption” curves maximizing both properties (Serafica et al., 2003)), depending on the wound environment, which makes it suitable for topical and implantable biomedical applications (Wu et al., 2023).

Eventually, in 2012, Serafica and the other owners of the company sold the firm to a large pharmaceutical company that nowadays continues to successfully manufacture and commercialize the aforementioned BC-based healthcare products (Serafica, 2016).

Besides a gift of the supercritical drying of microbial cellulose from a large paper company (and licensing from a large pharmaceutical company to Serafica’s company the exclusive rights to its patents for using microbial cellulose in wound-care dressings) (Kimberly-Clark, 2002), these achievements were possible by learning how to shift from research to product development, while completing regulatory requirements and develop clinical experience to support subsequent product commercialization. Eventually, Serafica concluded, “the most difficult part of the process” (Serafica, 2016) was in the selection of the right marketing partner as most new technologies “die” due to negligible market demand. Eventually, the third marketing partner was able to launch the product nationwide in the USA and, two years later, to commercialize it also in European countries so that after three more years a large pharmaceutical company purchased the whole business (Serafica, 2016).

On the other hand, in early 2018 the Canadian forest nanoproducts network “ArboraNano” funded in early 2009 by the Government of Canada was dissolved after completing more than 25 research projects. After being dissolved ArboraNano gave to FPInnovations (a not-for-profit R&D private organization which spans Canada’s 180 pulp and paper industry, forest, and wood product companies) the task “to elaborate a fundamental research program to better understand the technological gaps” (Roy, 2018).

In brief, whereas the bottom-up approach based on nanocellulose bacterial synthesis has been widely commercialized, two decades of intense applied researches were not enough to solve the main problem that so far delayed massive nanocellulose manufacturing by the top-down production routes.

For example, Nippon Paper, which operates a 500 t/a CNF plant based on the TEMPO oxidation process, in mid 2023 announced its intention “to soon put the new process into practical use in a bid to lower production costs referring to process capable to convey CNFs dispersed in water” (Nonomura, 2023). According to a company’s research manager “samples of CNFs once sold for as much as 100,000 yen (around \$750) per kilogram” (Nonomura, 2023). The firm’s objective in mid 2023 thus was “to get prices down to tens of thousands of yen” because “if prices can be squeezed to a few thousand yen, the market will grow dramatically” (Nonomura, 2023).

Japan, where a “Nanocellulose Forum” was established in 2014 to strengthen cooperation between industry, academic research, and government consolidated in 2020 into “Nanocellulose Japan”, is the world’s leading country in terms of industrial utilization of nanocellulose (Miyaniishi, 2019). In 2017, sports shoes whose midsoles are strengthened and their weight reduced by adding CNF (cellulose nanofibers are light and elastic but, like glass, show low thermal expansion and contraction) to the polymer, were the first commercial product containing CNF. In six years, the sports shoe company sold 10 million pairs of said high-performance shoes (Nonomura, 2023). On the other hand,

the high performance car tires whose rubber is functionalized with CNF for enhanced durability and ride comfort commercialized in 2019, today are no longer sold.

Japan-based researchers have already developed not-degrading gears made of polyacetal reinforced with CNF that are never worn away or wear away counterparts sliding on each other without lubricants; concept car that weighs about 15 % less and consumes 11 % less fuel than a conventional car of comparable size (presented in 2019); as well as reinforced plastic in which glass fiber is replaced by CNF affording CNF-reinforced plastics of exceptional degree of recyclability (when CNF-RP is recycled, the cellulose nanofibers do not break so that the mechanical and thermal properties are not degraded every time the plastic is recycled) (Yano Research Institute, 2023). From reinforced paper and board through sporting goods, vulcanized fiber, building materials, paints, audio equipment, personal care, cosmetic and food products, the list of products using CNF commercialized in Japan (Nanocellulose Japan, 2024) shows evidence of the often-claimed “exceptional versatility” of nanocellulose.

We have recently suggested that, along with low production cost, the two main drivers for successful bioproductions are the high price of the alternative, oil-based target product and access to readily available low cost raw material (Ciriminna, Angellotti, & Luque, 2024). Production of CNC via sulfuric acid hydrolysis is both capital intensive and has high operating costs even in the lowest cost plant configuration (without acid recovery), with feedstock cost and capital investment being the major cost drivers (Abbate de Assis et al., 2017). On the other hand, the price of transparent ethyl vinyl alcohol copolymers currently widely used in packaging for food preservation following the outbreak of COVID-19 climbed from \$5.5/kg in 2019 to \$11-\$14/kg at the end of 2022 (Lap-idot, 2023).

This creates room in the marketplace for CNC-based transparent coatings, well-known for their excellent oxygen, and oil and grease barrier properties, especially when extraction of CNC (using sulfuric acid at high concentration) takes place from the sludge produced by pulp and paper mills and not from expensive microcrystalline cellulose or bleached pulp. Indeed, a company based in Israel jointly owned by a large paper company based in Sweden originally targeting the production of “ecologically friendly foams”, recently commercialized a product available as water-based coating, that allows for the recyclability of plastic food packaging (Nanocellulose Japan, 2024). Actually, the coating can be applied also to cosmetic, pharmaceutical and agriculture packaging plastic products using existing standard industrial coating machines.

The latter feature of the technology is also important because industry is not willing to face substantial new investment in new coating devices to make their packaging sustainable, namely recyclable or reusable moving away from single-use plastics. The company, which operates a pilot-scale production line producing up to 100 kg of sulfated CNC per day, was recently forecasted to be able soon “to manufacture 200 tons of CNC per year in Sweden” (Wang et al., 2023).

4. Conclusions

As noted by Seifert and Fautz in 2021, the hype over nanotechnology is long over, and “expectations need to be revised down to a realistic measure” (Seifert & Fautz, 2021). This is the case, we have shown in this study, also for nanocellulose.

Forecasts dating back to 2014 for which the market of nanocellulose had a potential of 1.75 million tonnes globally for low volume (aerogels, wallboard facing, special paints, aircraft structure and interiors) and of 33 million tonnes for high volume applications (packaging coatings and fillers, paper coatings and fillers, automotive structure and interior, clothing textile and cement) (Nelson & Turpin, 2019) should be compared to reality. In 2018, the nanocellulose market amounted to 39, 600 t, with the largest share being made of MFC produced at pulp mills to functionalize paper and cardboard products (Scopus, 2024b).

The aforementioned estimates were based on the assumption that cellulose nanomaterials can reach the price target of \$4.4/kg to \$11/kg (Nelson & Turpin, 2019). As noted above, the research manager based at Nippon Paper (*i.e.*, the company operating the world's largest CNF manufacturing plant) in mid 2023 was still referring to his company striving for CNF "once sold for as much as 100,000 yen (around \$750) per kilogram" (Nonomura, 2023) aiming to "to get prices down to tens of thousands of yen" (Nonomura, 2023).

Remarkably, in sectors where the high \$50/g price of (bacterial) nanocellulose is not an issue, such as in the case of wound dressing or in neurosurgery, the market uptake of nanocellulose took only a few years (less than a decade, in the case of *XCell*, used also as the first brain implantable product (brain patch) (Seráfica, 2016)). On the other hand, in sectors where nanocellulose competes with widely employed and lower cost oil-derived products, nearly no commercial uptake of nanocellulose took place in over two decades of commercialization efforts.

So-called "forest" (wood and paper pulp) companies, namely so far the main investors in nanocellulose research and production plants (Charreau, Foresti & Vázquez, 2013, Charreau, Cavallo & Foresti, 2020), should be aware that their main competitors are chemical industry companies that produce nearly every polymer and fiber material from oil-derived feedstocks using highly efficient, continuous catalytic processes. This implies, as recently highlighted elsewhere (Ciriminna, Angellotti, & Luque, 2024), that the first successful productions of nanocellulose fibers for advanced applications will be those targeting the production of expensive nanocellulose-based products in relatively high demand (for example the strong, expensive carbon fibers used in aerospace and luxury vehicles) preferably from low cost cellulosic raw material (*i.e.*, not microcrystalline cellulose, bleached pulp or cotton).

Eventually, the large-scale uptake of cellulose nanofibers in place of synthetic organic polymers will happen when the existing nanocellulose production processes will be replaced by greener and significantly less energy-intensive processes allowing the long-awaited manufacturing cost reduction. Amid said processes, Karimi's and Pagliaro's teams have lately identified mechanochemistry ball milling, the one-pot heterogeneously catalyzed oxidation process over solid TEMPO-based catalyst, enzymatic catalysis, and cavitation (both acoustic and hydrodynamic) as the four most promising green chemistry routes to cellulose nanofiber or cellulose nanocrystals (Ciriminna, Ghahremani, Karimi and Pagliaro, 2023).

Hence, willing to answer the question "who should be interested and why?", researchers and companies developing new products from nanocellulose should be aware that a number of new processes to produce bacterial nanocellulose, CNC and CNF with high yield and at substantially lower cost have been developed, that allow for vertical integration (namely an arrangement in which the supply chain of a company is integrated by the same company). Others will most likely emerge.

Work on nanocellulose and research is indeed progressing rapidly. Pointing to unprecedented global interest, in the first fifteen days of 2024, Scopus already indexed 215 papers in peer reviewed journals (or selected preprint platforms) published in 2024, of which 194 were research papers (Scopus, 2024b). Furthermore, out of said 215 papers, 104 were authored by researchers based in China. This is relevant, because, from silicon solar cells through Li-ion batteries and light emitting diodes (LEDs), China's industrial system is renown for its ability to transfer knowledge to industry and start mass manufacturing.

In conclusion, this study puts the hype surrounding nanocellulose in the first two decades of the 2000s in the broader context of exaggerated promissory claims typical of nanotechnology (Mody, 2006, Bareis, Roßmann & Bordignon, 2023, Cowie, Bilek, Wegner & Shatkin, 2014), and also of chemistry (Hyland & Jiang, 2023).

Fulfilling the industrial potential of nanocellulose benefits from the main lesson learned during the hype technology phase, namely that virtually all large-scale applications of nanocellulose have been hindered by the high price of the biomaterial due, in its turn, to the current

energy-intensive fibrillation processes using harsh chemicals or enzymes. Informed by an evaluative conceptualization of hype (Gaillard, Mody and Halfman, 2023), a reflective approach to management and research aimed at accelerating progress towards large-scale production and commercialization of this versatile biomaterial will deliberately avoid hype and rather focus on the interdisciplinary and teamwork-based approaches to green chemistry invoked by Murphy, for which, the purpose of green chemistry is "to use already known science, engineering, and technology to try to make new and improved real-world processes and products, while preventing the formation of waste and pollutants" (Murphy, 2023).

CRedit authorship contribution statement

Rosaria Ciriminna: Writing – review & editing, Methodology, Funding acquisition, Conceptualization. **Giuseppe Angellotti:** Resources, Methodology, Investigation. **Rafael Luque:** Writing – review & editing, Methodology, Formal analysis, Conceptualization. **Matteo Formenti:** Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis. **Cristina Della Pina:** Writing – review & editing, Methodology, Investigation, Conceptualization. **Mario Pagliaro:** Writing – original draft, Methodology, Formal analysis, Conceptualization.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Data availability

No data was used for the research described in the article.

Acknowledgements

This study was partly carried out within the MICS - Made in Italy - Circular and Sustainable) Extended Partnership and received funding from the European Union Next-GenerationEU - Piano nazionale di ripresa e resilienza (Pnrr), Mission 4 Component 2, Investment 1.3, D.D. 1551.11-10-2022 (PE00000004).

References

- Aalto University. (2020). *Material manufacturing from particles takes a giant step forward, nanowerk*, 25 May <https://www.nanowerk.com/nanotechnology-news2/news/id=55120.php> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Abbati de Assis, C., Houtman, C., Phillips, R., Bilek, E. M., Rojas, O. J., Pal, L., Peresin, M. S., Jameel, H., & Gonzalez, R. (2017). Conversion economics of forest biomaterials: risk and financial analysis of CNC manufacturing. *Biofuel. Bioprod. Biorefin.*, 11, 682–700. <https://doi.org/10.1002/bbb.1782>
- Abitbol, T., Rivkin, A., Cao, Y., Nevo, Y., Abraham, E., Ben-Shalom, T., Lapidot, S., & Shoseyov, O. (2016). Nanocellulose, a tiny fiber with huge applications. *Curr. Op. Biotechnol.*, 39, 76–88. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2016.01.002>
- Alriksson, B. (2018). cit. In S. Matthis (Ed.), *Bacterial nanocellulose can become a strength enhancer*. *pulpapernews.com*, 2 May <http://www.pulpapernews.com/20190803/9456/bacterial-nanocellulose-can-become-strength-enhancer> (accessed January 15, 2024).
- Anthony, S. (2012). Nanocellulose: A cheap, conductive, stronger-than-Kevlar wonder material made from wood pulp. *ExtremeTech*, 23 August <https://www.extremetech.com/extreme/134910-nanocellulose-a-cheap-conductive-stronger-than-kevlar-wonder-material-made-from-wood-pulp> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Bareis, J., Roßmann, M., & Bordignon, F. (2023). Technology hype: dealing with bold expectations and overpromising. *TATuP J. Technol. Asses. Theory Pract.*, 32, 11–16. <https://doi.org/10.14512/tatup.32.3.10>
- Berger, M. (2023). Advanced flexible materials made from nanocellulose, *nanowerk*, 16 May. <https://www.nanowerk.com/spotlight/spotid=62997.php> (accessed January 5, 2024).
- Berger, M. (2024). *Editor of nanowerk and author of Nano-Society: Pushing the Boundaries of Technology; Nanotechnology: The Future is Tiny; and Nanoengineering: The Skills and Tools Making Technology Invisible*. All published by RSC Publishing.

- Berry, R. (2019). Improving barrier properties with cellulose nanocrystals. In 17th Biennial TAPPI European Place Conference, 20-22 May https://www.tappi.org/globalassets/documents/events/europlace_proceedings/04_6_richard-berry_improving-barrier-properties-with-cellulose-nanocrystals_tappi-place-porto_2019.pdf (accessed January 5, 2024).
- Bharimalla, A. K., Deshmukh, S. P., Patil, S., Nadanathangam, V., & Saxena, S. (2023). Development of energy efficient nanocellulose production process by enzymatic pretreatment and controlled temperature refining of cotton linters. *Cellulose*, 30, 833–847. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10570-022-04959-y>
- Charreau, H., Cavallo, E., & Foresti, M. L. (2020). Patents involving nanocellulose: Analysis of their evolution since 2010. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 237, Article 116039. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2020.116039>
- Charreau, H., Foresti, M. L., & Vázquez, A. (2013). Nanocellulose patents trends: A comprehensive review on patents on cellulose nanocrystals, microfibrillated and bacterial cellulose. *Recent Pat. Nanotechnol.*, 7, 56–80. <http://doi.org/10.2174/1872210511307010056>.
- Chinga Carrasco, G. (2020). Nanotechnology in the pulp and paper industry, nanowork, 20 May. <https://www.nanowork.com/spotlight/spotid=29627.php> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Ciriminna, R., Angellotti, G., & Luque, M. (2024). Green chemistry and the bioeconomy: a necessary nexus. *Biofuel. Biopr. Bioref.*, 18, 347–355. <https://doi.org/10.1002/bbb.2585>.
- Ciriminna, R., Ghahremani, M., Karimi, B., & Pagliaro, M. (2023). Emerging green routes to nanocellulose. *Biofuel. Biopr. Bioref.*, 17, 10–17. <https://doi.org/10.1002/bbb.2423>
- Clauser, N. M., Felissia, F. F., Area, M. C., & Vallejos, M. E. (2022). Technological and economic barriers of industrial-scale production of nanocellulose. In U. Shanker, C. M. Hussain, & M. Rani (Eds.), *In: Micro and Nano Technologies, Green Nanomaterials for Industrial Applications* (Ed.s, pp. 21–39). Amsterdam: Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-823296-5.00015-0>.
- Cowie, J., Bilek, E. M., Wegner, T. H., & Shatkin, J. A. (2014). Market projections of cellulose nanomaterial-enabled products - Part 2: Volume estimates. *Tappi Journal*, 13, 57–69. <https://doi.org/10.32964/TJ13.6.57>
- Dastager, S. (2021). Highly yield production of bacterial nano-cellulose useful for making medical and personal care products, match maker/renewable chemicals & materials. Match Maker/Renewable Chemicals & Materials, April 16. <http://www.techex.in/matchmaker/02/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/03-BNC-Final-1.pdf> (accessed January 15, 2024).
- de Nooy, A. E., Besemer, A. C., & van Bekkum, H. (1995). Highly selective nitroxyl radical-mediated oxidation of primary alcohol groups in water-soluble glucans. *Carbohydrate Research*, 269, 89–98. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0008-6215\(94\)00343-E](https://doi.org/10.1016/0008-6215(94)00343-E)
- Dufresne, A. (2013). Nanocellulose: a new ageless bionanomaterial. *Mater. Today*, 16, 220–227. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matod.2013.06.004>.
- Dufresne, A. (2019). Nanocellulose processing properties and potential applications. *Curr. Forestry Rep.*, 5, 76–89. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40725-019-00088-1>
- Eklund, J. (2014). *Master Thesis*. Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences.
- Konoka Equity (2024). CelluForce. <https://www.konaequity.com/company/celluforce4848582298/> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Ferguson, W. (2012). Wood pulp is surprise new wonder material. *New Scientist*, 215, 24. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0262-4079\(12\)62122-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0262-4079(12)62122-8)
- Frankel, V. H., Serafica, G. C., & Damien, C. J. (2004). Development and testing of a novel biosynthesized XCell for treating chronic wounds. *Surgical Technology International*, 12, 27–33.
- Gaillard, S., Mody, C., & Halfman, W. (2023). Overpromising in science and technology: An evaluative conceptualization. *TATuP J. Technol. Asses. Theory Pract.*, 32, 60–65. <https://doi.org/10.14512/tatup.32.3.60>
- Hou, S., Xia, Z., Pan, J., Wang, N., Gao, H., Ren, J., & Xia, X. (2023). Bacterial cellulose applied in wound dressing materials: production and functional modification - a review. *Macromolecular Bioscience.*, Article 2300333. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mabi.202300333>
- Hyland, K., & Jiang, F. (2023). Hypeing the REF: promotional elements in impact submissions. *High. Educ.* <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-023-01030-y>
- Jaiswal, A. K., Kumar, V., Khakalo, A., Lahtinen, P., Solin, K., Pere, J., & Toivakka, M. (2021). Rheological behavior of high consistency enzymatically fibrillated cellulose suspensions. *Cellulose*, 28, 2087–2104. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10570-021->
- Klaessig, F. (2021). Traversing technology trajectories. *NanoEthics*, 15, 149–168. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11569-021-00398-4>.
- Klemm, D., Kramer, F., Moritz, S., Lindström, T., Ankerfors, M., & Gray, D. (2011). Nanocelluloses: A new family of nature-based materials. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.*, 50, 5438–5466. <https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.201001273>
- Klemm, D., Cranston, E. D., Fischer, D., Gama, M., Kedzior, S. A., Kralisch, D., Kramer, F., Kondo, T., Lindström, T., Nietzsche, S., Petzold-Welcke, K., & Rauchfuß, F. (2018). Nanocellulose as a natural source for groundbreaking applications in materials science: Today's state. *Mater. Today*, 21, 720–748. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matod.2018.02.001>
- Klemm, D., Heublein, B., Fink, H.-P., & Bohn, A. (2005). Cellulose: Fascinating biopolymer and sustainable raw material. *Angew Chem. Int. Ed.*, 44, 3358–3393. <https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.200460587>
- Lam, W. S., Lee, P. F., & Lam, W. H. (2022). Cellulose nanofiber for sustainable production: A bibliometric analysis. *Materials Today Proceedings*, 62, 6460–6467. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matpr.2022.04.198>
- Lapidot, S. (2023). Cit. In: Barrier product for the recyclability of plastic food packaging. *Nutraceutical Business Review*, 12 July. https://nutraceuticalbusinessreview.com/news/article_page/Barrier_product_for_the_recyclability_of_plastic_food_packaging/210019 (accessed January 10, 2024).
- Latta, G. S., Plantinga, A. J., & Sloggy, M. R. (2016). The effects of Internet use on global demand for paper products. *Journal of Forestry*, 114, 433–440. <https://doi.org/10.5849/jof.15-096>
- Market Data Forecast. (2023). *Nanocellulose Market - By Type (Microfibrillated Cellulose, Cellulose Nanocrystals), Application (Pulp & paper, Composites & packaging, Biomedical & pharmaceuticals, Electronics & sensors) & By Region (North America, Latin America, Europe, Asia Pacific, Middle East & Africa) - Industry Analysis on Size, HyderabadIndia: Growth, Investment and Forecasts | 2023-2028*. <https://www.marketdataforecast.com/market-reports/nanocellulose-market> (accessed December 15, 2023).
- Market Research Future. (2023). *Nanocellulose Market Research Report Information by Type*. November <https://www.marketresearchfuture.com/reports/nanocellulose-market-4554> (accessed December 15, 2023).
- Miyaniishi, T. (2019). Nanocellulose in Japan: an industrial perspective. *TAPPI J.*, 18(4), 265–267.
- Mody, C. (2006). Small, but determined. Technological determinism in nanoscience. In J. Schummer, & D. Baird (Eds.), *Nanotechnology challenges. Implications for philosophy, ethics and society* (Ed.s, pp. 95–130). Singapore: World Scientific. https://doi.org/10.1142/9789812773975_0006.
- Murphy, M. A. (2023). Professors Trost and Sheldon's promotion of catalytic technologies, atom economy, and the E-factor metrics in synthetic organic chemistry and the fine chemical and pharmaceutical industries, to speed the early evolution of "green chemistry. *Substantia*, 7, 41–55. <https://doi.org/10.36253/Substantia-2140>
- Melodea, MelOx Data Sheet, 2024. https://melodea.eu/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/melodeas-formula-melox-tds_2023.pdf (accessed January 12, 2024).
- Nanocellulose Japan, Products using Nanocellulose in Japan, 2024. <https://nanocellulose.biz/en/products/> (accessed January 10, 2024).
- Nanomaterial Powder (2023). Cellulose Nanocrystal (Nanocrystalline Cellulose,CNC). <https://nanomaterialpowder.com/nano/cellulose-nanocrystal-nanocrystalline-cellulosecnc/> (accessed December 15, 2023).
- Kimberly-Clark Worldwide donates intellectual property to Rensselaer. (2002). *EurekaAlert*, 8 October <https://www.eurekaalert.org/news-releases/895305> (accessed January 10, 2024).
- Nanowerk (2023). Search with the query "nanocellulose" carried out through the search button at nanowerk.com on December 18, 2023.
- Nelson, K., & Turpin, D. (2019). *Advancing Commercialization of Nanocellulose: Critical Challenges Workshop Report*. Washington, DC: Alliance for Pulp & Paper Technology Innovation. <https://doi.org/10.13140/rg.2.2.33789.59363>. May 7-8.
- Nonomura, F. (2023). Cit. In: Matsuoka, K. (2023). In Japan, cellulosic nanofibers look to leave the lab. *Chem. Eng. News* 101 (12), 18-19.
- Norrahim, M. N. F., Mohd Kasim, N. A., Feizal Knight, V., Ujang, F. A., Janudin, N., Razak, M. A. I. A., Shah, N. A. A., Noor, S. A. M., Jamal, S. H., Ong, K. K., & Wan Yunus, W. M. Z. (2021). Nanocellulose: the next super versatile material for the military. *Materials Advances*, 2, 1485–1506. <https://doi.org/10.1039/D0ma01011a>.
- Ono, H., Shimaya, Y., Sato, K., & Ono, T. (2004). ¹H spin-spin relaxation time of water and rheological properties of cellulose nanofiber dispersion, transparent cellulose hydrogel (TCG). *Polymer Journal*, 36, 684–694. <https://doi.org/10.1295/polymj.36.684>
- Qvintus, P., Kangas, H. (2015). Cellulose nanofibrils (CNF) – A big hype or on the edge of a breakthrough?, 27 May. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Yctog3J7shk> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Ranby, B. G., & Ribí, E. (1950). Über den feinaufbau der zellulose. *Experimentia*, 6, 12–14. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02154044>
- Roy, G. (2018). Le défi de la nanocellulose. Opérations Forestières et de Scierie, 24 January. <https://www.operationsforestieres.ca/le-defide-la-nanocellulose-3011/> (accessed January 10, 2024).
- Saito, T., Nishiyama, Y., Putaux, J.-L., Vignon, M., & Isogai, A. (2006). Homogeneous suspensions of individualized microfibrils from TEMPO-catalyzed oxidation of native cellulose. *Biomacromolecules*, 7, 1687–1691. <https://doi.org/10.1021/bm060154s>
- Scopus, (2024a). Search carried out at scopus.com on January 5, 2024 amid indexed documents using the query "nanocellulose" within "Article title, Abstract, Keywords".
- Scopus, (2024b). Search carried at scopus.com on January 15, 2024 using the query "nanocellulose" within "Article title, Abstract, Keywords" limiting the search to year 2024.
- Seifert, F., & Fautz, C. (2021). Hype after hype: from bio to nano to AI. *Nanoethics*, 15, 143–148. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11569-021-00399-3>
- Serafica, Dr. G. (2016). *Commercialization of Technology*. University of the Philippines Internet TV Network. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=h_fFMYG6ToCI&t=1663s (accessed January 5, 2024).
- Serafica, G., Mormino, R., Oster, G.A., Lentz, K.E. & Koehler, K.P. (2003). Microbial cellulose wound dressing for treating chronic wounds, US7704523B2.
- Thomas, B., Raj, M. C., Athira, K. B., Rubiyah, M. H., Joy, J., Moores, A., Drisko, G. L., & Sanchez, C. (2018). Nanocellulose, a versatile green platform: from biosources to materials and their applications. *Chemical Reviews*, 118, 11575–11625. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.7b00627>
- Turbak, A. F., Snyder, F. W., & Sandberg, K. R. (1983). Microfibrillated cellulose, a new cellulose product: properties, uses, and commercial potential. In A. Sarko (Ed.), 37. *Proceedings of the Ninth Cellulose Conference, Applied Polymer Symposia* (pp. 815–827). New York: Wiley.
- VTT. (2022). *VTT develops transparent cellulose film to replace traditional plastic in food packaging*, 6 June <https://www.vttresearch.com/en/news-and-ideas/vtt-develops-transparent-cellulose-film-replace-traditional-plastic-food-packaging> (accessed April 22, 2024).
- Vähä-Nissi, M. (2018). *Innovative cellulose-based multilayer packaging films*. Vienna: Multilayer Flexible Packaging, 19-21 November.

- Wang, Y., Liu, H., Wang, Q., An, X., Ji, X., Tian, Z., Liu, S., & Yang, G. (2023). Recent advances in sustainable preparation of cellulose nanocrystals via solid acid hydrolysis: A mini-review. *International Journal Of Biological Macromolecules*, 253, Article 127353. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijbiomac.2023.127353>
- Wu, Z., Chen, S., Li, J., Wang, B., Jin, M., Liang, Q., Zhang, D., Han, Z., Deng, L., Qu, X., & Wang, H. (2023). Insights into hierarchical structure-property-application relationships of advanced bacterial cellulose materials. *Advanced Functional Materials*, 33, Article 2214327. <https://doi.org/10.1002/adfm.202214327>
- Yano Research Institute (2023). Cit. In: Matsuoka K. (2023). In Japan, cellulosic nanofibers look to leave the lab. *Chem. Eng. News*. 101 (12), 18-19.
- Zhang, F., R.Shen, N. Li, Yang, X., & Lin, D. (2023). Nanocellulose: An amazing nanomaterial with diverse applications in food science. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 304, Article 120497. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2022.120497>